

## **BOARD OF APPRAISERS MEETING**

**Dayton, Ohio**

**November 6, 2024**

The meeting of the Board of Appraisers of The Miami Conservancy District (MCD) and its Subdistricts was called to order at 9:03 a.m. with David K. Galbreath, Jr., Chairman; Adam P. Kranbuhl, Member; and Joseph P. Kelley, Member present. The meeting was held at MCD headquarters, 38 East Monument Avenue, Dayton, Ohio 45402.

Members of the staff in attendance: MaryLynn Lodor, General Manager/Board Secretary; Sarah Hippensteel Hall, Manager of Communications, Outreach, and Stewardship; Kenneth P. Moyer, Treasurer; Donald P. O'Connor, Chief Engineer; Amanda Phillips, GIS Analyst; and Barry M. Puskas, Chief of Technical and Engineering Services.

Legal counsel in attendance: Lee A. Slone, McMahon DeGulis LLP, and John M. Hoopingarner, McMahon DeGulis LLP.

Guests in attendance: John Meininger, Carol Malesky, and Katie Greer, all from Stantec Consulting Services, Inc., attended via Teams.

### **COMPLIANCE WITH SUNSHINE LAW AND BYLAWS**

The meeting was held in compliance with the Sunshine Law and MCD and Subdistrict Bylaws. The meeting information was posted on MCD's website. Miami Valley news media and individuals requesting such notification were notified of this meeting by electronic mail dated November 1, 2024.

### **MINUTES**

The Minutes of the Board of Appraisers meeting of September 5, 2024, were provided to members of the Board for review and comment. The Board of Appraisers, on motion by Mr. Kelley and seconded by Mr. Kranbuhl, unanimously approved the minutes for the September 5, 2024, meeting.

Next, Ms. Lodor recapped the purpose of the Benefit Assessment Study and emphasized that Stantec Consulting Services, Inc. (Stantec), has been actively working on all tasks outlined in the September 5 meeting. The intent of this meeting was to provide a status update, for the Board of Appraisers, on the tasks and findings to date. Ms. Lodor indicated that the tasks are still underway, but the information shared will help familiarize the Board of Appraisers with the different benefit appraisal methodology used by other flood districts in the state and country while also obtaining feedback for further analysis and discussion for early December.

Next, Ms. Lodor introduced Mr. John Menninger of Stantec, to review the status of the four tasks of the Benefit Assessment Study. Mr. Menninger discussed the findings of Stantec's hydraulic analysis and answered questions from the modeling that included the 10-, 50-, 100-, 500-Year; OPF; 1913 Discharge.

Mr. Menninger provided an overview of the direct benefits calculation using FEMA and MCD approaches. The initial comparison between FEMA and MCD benefits indicates that MCD undervalues the total benefit and the partial benefits. Benefits to the broader community or "indirect benefits" are in development and will be completed and shared at the December meeting.

Mr. Menninger also provided an overview of the benchmarked data and pilot areas to be used in comparison of potential benefit methodology options and alternatives. Stantec has identified four approaches for discussion – all are focused on the counties that are part of the conservancy district: 1) District Watershed Approach - similar to Muskingum and Margaret Creek where every parcel in nine counties is assessed; 2) Combo - Watershed Approach - similar to Chippewa and Hunters Run with a direct benefit area and indirect benefits at district-watershed scale; 3) Combo - Expanded Community - rebalance indirect and direct benefits at a district-watershed scale; and 4) Simplify Benefit Appraisal - modifications/tweaks to current methodology using the current boundaries of the flood protection district. Stantec will take feedback from the Board of Appraisers and perform additional refinement with MCD staff and these four approaches will be the basis of the presentation of options at a future meeting.

The last item on the agenda was future meetings. It was determined that December 11 will be the next Board of Appraisers meeting.


#### **ADJOURN**

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned on motion by Adam P. Kranbuhl, and seconded by Joseph P. Kelley at 11:45 p.m.

**ATTEST:**

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
MaryLynn Lodor  
General Manager/Board Secretary

**APPROVED:**

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
David K. Galbreath, Jr.  
Chairman